

**MANUSCRITOS PLURILINGÜES Y PLURIGRÁFICOS
DE ORIENTE Y OCCIDENTE**

Comité: Giuseppe Mandalà, Alex Metcalfe, Inmaculada Pérez Martín

27-28 Septiembre 2012

**Centro de Ciencias Humanas y Sociales,
Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas
C/ Albasanz 26-28, 28037 Madrid
Sala Menéndez Pidal 0E18**

ABSTRACTS

PAOLA DEGNI (Università di Bologna)

Il multilinguismo nella Sicilia normanna: aspetti ed estensione del fenomeno

The practice and the diffusion of the plurilingualism will be analyzed with particular regard to Norman Sicily and using indirect and direct evidence (inscriptions, manuscripts, documents). Specific attention will be devoted to evaluating of records as regard as communicative and cultural strategies.

JULIA BECKER (Universität Heidelberg)

Plurilinguismo nei documenti e nella cancelleria di Ruggero I e Ruggero II di Sicilia (1080-1154)

Southern Italy, which from a political point of view belonged to the Byzantine Catepanate of Italy, in the period of the Norman conquest was administered from Byzantine catepans and dominated by a Greek-speaking population and the Greek Christian faith of the Church of Constantinople. Sicily, however, was controlled by individual Arab emirs and had an Arabic-speaking majority which belonged to the

Islamic faith. Additionally, minorities in the above mentioned areas have to be taken in consideration: Greek and Arab Christians (Mozarabs) were living in Sicily, Arabs in Calabria, Jewish communities existed on both, the island as well as the mainland. As both were far away from being a cohesive unit with wide political and administrative experience and a minority, Norman conquerors had to adapt to the local conditions and traditions, especially with respect to the languages spoken. The documents of Roger I and Roger II initially were written in Greek and Arabic language and only time after time Latin became more important. The fact that the Normans had not established a functioning chancery facilitated the reception of formulas and documents of the Muslim and Byzantine administration. Similar to the Anglo Norman kings who continued to use the English-Latin “writs”, Roger I and Roger II adopted the Byzantine *sigillion* – the Arab lists of tax-payers and descriptions of estate boundaries.

Showing various selected examples, my presentation will demonstrate the extent to which we can find multilingualism in the documents of Roger I and Roger II. Further to that, an overview will be provided, how functioned the cooperation between the multilingual notaries in the chancery and in what way the linguistic composition of the public documents changed under the Norman rule in Sicily.

MIRELLA CASSARINO (Università di Catania)

Lo studio della diplomatica arabo-greca di Sicilia in prospettiva linguistica

The *ğara'id* and the Sicilian diplomas of the Norman period, published in the second half of the nineteenth century by Salvatore Cusa, are of fundamental importance not only for the reconstruction and the understanding of the history of Sicily, but also for the reconstruction of the history of linguistic variation on the island in particular and in the Islamic west in general. The presentation will be divided into two parts. The first of these will discuss: a) some of the problems presented by the types of documentation studied with regard to linguistic analysis (for example, what can really be gleaned from these *scriptae* regarding the oral context in which they were drawn up, the heuristic

value of deviations in orthography, phonetics and morphosyntax, the background and the position of the scribes, the dating of the documents, etc.); b) some methodological questions, also regarding research carried out thus far regarding the Arabic in which they were created (De Simone, Agius, etc.). In the second part a series of linguistic features that can be attributed to Middle Arabic will be presented, with particular regard to those relating to morphosyntax, which has been neglected up to now. The intention is to demonstrate, by means of a new approach that bears in mind the progress made in the fields of Arabic Dialectology and research on Middle Arabic, the importance of the linguistic study of this documentation and of other “middle” texts produced in Sicily. All this within the framework of a wider reconstruction of the history and the features of western Middle Arabic.

MARCELLO MOSCONE (Università di Palermo)

Traduttori e traduzioni documentarie (dal greco e dall'arabo) a Palermo fra XIII e XIV secolo

The paper aims to illustrate the practice, largely diffused in Palermo during the second half of the XIIIth and the first half of the XIVth century, of translating documents that were originally written in Greek, in Arabic or bilingual Greek-Arabic into Latin. Generally, these translations were authenticated in a court or, in most cases, through the authority of the *iudex contractuum* and of the notary. In particular, this paper will focus on the textual structure of these documents and on the legal processes that would have transformed them into legally accepted translations, submissable as evidence in a court of law. Special attention will be also given to the role of the *interpretes*, who were called upon to translate the original texts, which had become unintelligible to the majority of people and so were no longer useful in the evaluation of claims and rights. Taken as a whole and identified as an object of study within its own right, the *corpus* reflects the linguistic changes of the intellectual *élite* of Palermo between XIIIth and

XIVth century, when the phenomenon of multilingualism in the city was gradually drawing to a close.

CRISTINA ROGNONI (Università di Palermo)

Pratica giuridica e lingua nei documenti privati greci del XII e XIII secolo

This presentation will elaborate on deeds drawn up in Greek during the twelfth and thirteenth centuries in Messina and Val Demone, the area in which the Hellenophone presence is known to have been the most deeply rooted. The Church and the Greek monarchy exerted widespread influence, at least in the countryside, and the Byzantine cultural tradition, within which the notarial writing style was perhaps a minor but nonetheless important aspect, was even more persistent. Document analysis supports two interpretive paths from which plurilingual phenomena, partially hidden by language uniformity and writing uniformity in translations of that language, can be singled out and studied.

(1) Social interactions. The social interactions indicated by the presence of the involved parties, including authors, beneficiaries, witnesses, authorities—whose everyday language remains unknown to us—may be traced through these legal transactions and are represented through writing by one of the three official languages of the kingdom, Greek, Latin or Arabic.

(2) The language of the document. Written deeds translate more or less complex operations of legal procedure into a special language. They begin with an expression of intent and have as their aim the manifestation and demonstration of a right. Laws, formulas and clauses guarantee the validity of both the action and the *engraphon* (*scriptum*) which that action provides for, demonstrates and warrants. The Greek language in the documents, therefore, has its own vocabulary, syntax and rhetoric. Partly crystallized as it is, and in part necessarily shaped by the very circumstances it expresses, this language often means much more than it says within the parchment frame in which it was written out. Some deem the Greek language of these Southern

Italian documents artificial but coarse, whereas others consider it early evidence of the transition from medieval to modern Greek; it was certainly exposed to contacts with and loans from other linguistic sources, but it was also embroidered with erudite and outdated terms, hinting at dictionary/lexicon consultation. These features of the language illustrate the theme of this conference in several respects.

ALEX METCALFE (Lancaster University and Khalili Research Centre, Oxford)

State of the art or art of the state? Reflections on the bilingual documents of Norman Sicily

Until recently, linguists and historians have tended to ask very different questions of the bilingual texts of Norman Sicily. Although this discipline divergence has narrowed, there remain important points of variance, particularly with regard to methodologies. These are most apparent when assessing the interplay between Arabic and Greek texts – a problem compounded by extreme document loss from the pre-Norman period. However, accounting for that loss from a historical perspective may help to understand why Greek appears alongside Arabic in some of the early comital grants of the 1090s in what were products of a quite particular set of circumstances. Closer inspection of the relationships between these two administrative languages from a linguistic point of view implies that Greek may have exerted far more of an influence on chancery Arabic than previously thought. By the mid-1100s, however, both languages were more clearly serving purposes other than merely information-bearing media in what was a semiotic triumph of style over substance for the new Arab-Norman diwan.

LARS HOFFMANN (Universität Frankfurt am Main)

Bilingual manuscripts as a sign of an ending culture? The case of Nicolas-Nectarius of Otranto

During the reign of the Emperor Frederick II from the house of Hohenstaufen, the Greek language and culture in Southern Italy apparently has had a last bloom. Since the Normans in the year 1071 have forced the Byzantines to leave the country, Latin more and more has advanced the source language in that region although during the next two centuries especially a great many of clergymen took care for the Greek which they were in need of for their church rite. Besides such efforts the Greek experienced a kind of comeback during the first half of the 13th century, and Nicolas-Nectarius, the abbot of a Basilian monastery nearby Otranto, could be considered as one of the protagonists of that development which was caused by the political conditions of the time. The abbot himself has had a solid command of both languages, maybe also of Hebrew, and for that reason he wrote down also some bilingual manuscripts, and two of them are remaining up to our days. With the end of the Stauffer in Southern Italy in the year 1266 and with the succeeding family of the Anjou, the papal predominance was exceedingly enforced also in that region, the church rite was Latinized step by step so that Greek as cultural language disappeared more and more. The lecture first and foremost will deal with the abbot Nicolas-Nectarius as manuscript writer who cannot be regarded without his specific cultural and political environment.

DANIELE ARNESANO (Università del Salento)

Bilinguismo nei documenti pugliesi medievali

The coexistence of different ethnic groups in medieval Puglia gave rise to phenomena of acculturation among people of Greek, Latin, Hebrew, Armenian, and Arabic language. Some elements strengthen the hypothesis that part of the ruling class (active *in loco* or traveling), the notary and the clergy were bilingual (Greek/Latin), but a survey of inscriptions, books and documents highlights how evidences of multilingual and multigraphic inscriptions or manuscripts is actually quite rare (except for the substantial production of Salento bilingual books of the 13th and 14th centuries). It is also an exceptional case to find individuals whose ability to master two languages and

two scripts can be proved with certainty (Nektarios of Casole). As part of a "multigrafismo assoluto" at the regional level (with a Greek pole in Taranto and Salento and a Latin pole in Bari and the rest of Puglia), the intimate coexistence of languages and scripts is reflected in the phenomena of hybridism and mutual influence (such as the import of Latin elements in Greek script and of Greek manner in Latin script), but also in the use of the same alphabet (Greek and Hebrew) to write in ancient or newer languages (Latin, Italian, French, English). These and other phenomena pose new questions which require an in-depth analysis and open up new perspectives for linguistic and paleographic studies.

BENOÎT GRÉVIN (LAMOP, CNRS, Paris)

Le ms. Urb. lat. 1384: propositions pour une édition interdisciplinaire (à propos d'un manuscrit arabo-latin créé pour la cour d'Urbino)

Le manuscrit Vat. Urb. 1384 est l'un des exemples les plus fascinants d'artefact bilingue arabo-latin du XVe siècle. Elaboré en Italie sous la direction de Guglielmo Raimondo Moncada pour le duc d'Urbino autour de 1480, décoré par des professionnels, il a impliqué un travail d'équipe et comprend une série de textes magiques, religieux et scientifiques de nature très différente. Les études parfois excellentes menées jusqu'ici sur ses différentes parties ne peuvent pas résoudre l'ensemble des questions posées par cet objet, dont la compréhension définitive nécessite une édition globale, probablement menée par une équipe interdisciplinaire, et dont on discute ici les conditions.

LAURA MINERVINI (Università di Napoli "Federico II")

Jewish Multilingual Texts in Christian Spain (13.-15. c)

Most of the texts written by Jews in Christian Spain are in Hebrew language and script. Still, the group of multilingual and multigraphic texts deserves careful attention, because it points out some of the peculiarities of the Jewish experience in Medieval Iberia. Multilingual texts are more common than multigraphic texts: the former include

texts originally conceived as multilingual – such as glossaries – and texts where multilingualism is an occasional feature – e.g. owners’ notes in manuscripts. Multigraphic texts are usually also multilingual, and multigraphism is rarely integrated in the texts, i.e. it is more commonly the result of subsequent operations of the readers of the texts or the owners of the manuscripts. We would like to sketch a typology of these multigraphic and multilingual texts and relate them to the overall textual production of the Iberian Jews.

MARIA ÁNGELES GALLEGO (CCHS, CSIC, Madrid)

Arabic lexicography commented on multiple languages: on a rare specimen of Jewish transmission of Arabic linguistic knowledge

The Arabic influence on Hebrew medieval lexicography and Hebrew linguistics in general is a well established fact. It is not clear yet, however, how and in what terms did Jewish scholars adopt the linguistic knowledge of the Arabs. Research on this field has been carried out almost exclusively on the basis of text comparison between Muslim and Jewish works on grammar, such as those published in the last decades by the Israeli scholar Dan Becker.

In this paper I will present a late medieval lexicographical work written in Judeo-Arabic in the Iberian Peninsula which shows the impact of Arabic dictionaries on the Jewish linguistic tradition in a different way. The author has adapted for Jewish readers the renown Arabic dictionary *Mukhtasar al-‘ayn*, adding explanations of his own and additional text from other classical Arabic dictionaries. The contents of this work offer an exceptional example of the process of transmission of linguistic knowledge between the two communities. Furthermore, the manuscript includes glosses written in a later period in other languages including Greek and Latin, showing its relevance and possible use among Christians in later periods.

LAURA FERNÁNDEZ FERNÁNDEZ (Universidad Complutense, Madrid)

Multilingüismo textual e icónico en el Libro del saber de astrología de Alfonso el Sabio: entre la necesidad teórica y la erudición estética

El *Libro del saber de astrología* es uno de los textos que mejor expresa el plurilingüismo presente en la corte de Alfonso X el Sabio. Éste se manifiesta desde diferentes puntos de vista, tanto a través de los usos lingüísticos de los integrantes del equipo que participó en su redacción, de las fuentes utilizadas para la definición del contenido que inevitablemente condicionaron el vocabulario del texto, así como del uso consciente de vocablos en diferentes lenguas con la intención de otorgar al producto un acabado erudito y lo más completo posible. Dicho plurilingüismo no debe ser únicamente contemplado en clave textual ya que la definición icónica de este libro, su lenguaje visual, es fruto igualmente de la asimilación y coexistencia de diferentes tradiciones culturales. El texto es el resultado de la compilación de una serie de tratados de contenido variopinto aunque planteados de forma conjunta en función de una unidad temática: disponer de las herramientas imprescindibles para la observación y el estudio de los astros, aplicado al levantamiento del horóscopo. El objetivo del libro, tal y como queda recogido en repetidas ocasiones a lo largo del propio texto, era el de agrupar todo el saber referente a la observación de los astros de tal manera que no fuera necesario consultar otras fuentes, por lo tanto con una intención enciclopédica. Este proceso comenzó en una etapa temprana del reinado de Alfonso X, hacia 1255, momento en el que se encargaron las primeras traducciones de las obras árabes que serán incluidas en esta compilación, las cuales posteriormente serían revisadas y complementadas con material creado ex novo dando como resultado el *Libro del saber de astrología*, finalizado en la ciudad de Burgos en 1278. Desgraciadamente el manuscrito de la Cámara Regia, (Ms. 156, BH), ha sufrido mutilaciones y destrozos que han alterado su estructura y nos han privado de parte de su programa textual e icónico original. No obstante, a partir de las copias conservadas se ha podido reconstruir en su totalidad el texto del manuscrito, y en cierta medida su repertorio figurativo. (Ms. 8174, BAV; Ms.

1197, BNE; Ms. 9/5707, BRAH; Ms. Canon. Misc. 340, BLOX; Ms. 3306, BNE; Ms. h-I-1, RBME; Ms. V-II-9, RBME).

NURIA MARTÍNEZ DE CASTILLA MUÑOZ (Universidad Complutense, Madrid)

Plurilingual identities in XVIth Century Christian Spain: the case of the Qur'anic manuscripts

In spite of a widespread ignorance of Arabic among the Moriscos (the last Muslims of the Iberian peninsula), and the prohibition of the possession of books in Arabic script, the Moriscos kept transcribing and transmitting the Qur'ân. To this day, about 100 such copies have been found. These copies exhibit various peculiarities related either to their physical presentation, or to their cultural meaning. In the majority of the cases, the Qur'anic text is found along with other religious or didactical tracts within miscellanies or composite volumes. In other cases, the manuscripts contain only Qur'anic material, followed by an amulet or a prayer. In 25% of the cases analyzed, there is translation, either interlinear or paragraph by paragraph, in Spanish language written in Arabic script (aljamia). The translation is sometimes a word for word rendering, sometimes it includes explanations, with tafsir elements. In the remaining 75% of the cases, there is only the Arabic text of the Qur'ân. However, all these copies, with a single exception, share a common feature: they are organised selections of surahs of the Qur'ân, not always complete ones, sometimes transcribed in a continuous manner (i.e. without any indication when passing from a surah or a verse to another one). This kind of Qur'anic copies, also circulating in other parts of the Muslim world, e. g. the Ottoman Empire, can help us in understanding from a socio-cultural point of view the creed of the Morisco communities of 16th and 17th centuries Spain.

ROSER SALICRÚ I LLUCH (Institució Milà i Fontanals, CSIC, Barcelona)

Prácticas bilingües en los contactos diplomáticos entre la Corona de Aragón y el Islam Occidental en la Baja Edad Media

A raíz de los contactos privilegiados que, a lo largo de la edad media, la Corona de Aragón mantuvo con el Islam occidental, el Archivo de la Corona de Aragón conserva alrededor de dos centenares de documentos originales expedidos, en árabe, desde tierras islámicas; algunas traducciones romanceadas coetáneas de los mismos; y algunos ejemplares de correspondencia expedida directamente en caracteres latinos y en lengua romance desde las cancillerías islámicas. Además, alberga también copias registradas de millares de documentos enviados por los monarcas de la Corona de Aragón hacia tierras islámicas. Toda esta documentación, que es conocida pero que, en realidad, en muchos aspectos todavía ha sido poco estudiada, será analizada desde un doble prisma: en primer lugar, el de las prácticas lingüísticas de los contactos entre mundo cristiano y mundo islámico que la documentación permite descubrir; en segundo lugar, el de la concreción multilingüe (y plurigráfica) que dichas prácticas adoptaron por escrito en la correspondencia diplomática mantenida entre la Corona de Aragón y los poderes islámicos occidentales bajomedievales.

FRÉDÉRIC BAUDEN (Université de Liège)

The Cyprus tribute paid to the Mamluks. The perspective from the Mamluks

Since 1426, after its conquest by the Mamluks, Cyprus was considered by the Mamluk sultanate as a vassal state subordinated to the sultan who regarded its ruler, the king, as a governor (*na'ib*). The symbols of this subordination were the dispatch of a letter of appointment to every new ruler succeeding the king accompanied with a robe of honor (*khil'a*) on the Mamluk side and the payment of an annual tribute in cash and luxury articles on the Cypriot side. When the Venetians became the overlords of the island in 1489, with the abdication of Queen Cornaro, negotiations took place in Cairo regarding the recognition of the Republic's effective power and the delicate transfer of authority under Mamluk rule. For the Mamluk sultan, the main issue was the payment of the tribute, an important source of income in these years where the sultan had to face

important expenditures for his military campaigns against the Ottomans. In the frame of this conference, the starting point of our paper will be a Mamluk document preserved at the State Archives in Venice which was issued for the payment of the tribute paid by Venice on behalf of Cyprus in October 1490. Its study, combined with the analysis of the Venetian ambassador's minutes, will allow us to address the critical question of the negotiations between two leading powers in the Mediterranean.

JUAN SIGNES (Universidad de Valladolid)

Los léxicos jurídicos greco-latinos en Bizancio

Multilingualism was one of the main features of the Byzantine society, but it does not emerge in the official written culture, which is mainly monolingual and rests on Greek, particularly between 7th and 13th centuries. Accordingly, before the 7th c. we find in the Empire abundant evidence of the pervading bilingualism in Latin and Greek, either in the official inscriptions, in the grammatical manuscripts or even in explicit references of the sources. This official bilingual culture disappeared with the end of Antiquity, so that the (Greco-)Latin grammatical manuscripts, even those composed in the East (like the famous Latin grammar of Priscian, which was addressed to the Greeks) continued to be copied only in the West. On the other hand, the growing interest for Latin in Byzantium after the 13th century (with Planudes as forerunner) does not leave any imprint in manuscripts until the 15th century, where some bilingual manuscripts of grammatical content appear, probably originating in the area of Crete. However, the lack of Byzantine manuscripts written in a language other than Greek for the 7th-13th centuries does not mean that the Byzantine court was alien to other cultures or languages, as is proved by the official interpreters and the creation of new alphabets for neighbouring countries on the basis of the Greek and with the support of the Byzantine state. It is against this background that I pretend to consider the transmission of some Latin-Greek lexica of law terms in Byzantium, which are in fact the only bilingual manuscripts preserved and represent the exception to the rule. I will refer to the scribal

errors on them concerning Latin words and will try to explain them by means both of palaeographical and historical considerations. For the first ones I will deal with the formal convergence of the typology of the letters in juridical bilingual manuscripts since the reign of Justinian; for the second ones I will approach the vanishing interest for the Latin vocabulary in Byzantium since the process of Hellenization of the terminology undertaken in the 9th and 10th centuries.

JUAN PEDRO MONFERRER SALA (Universidad de Córdoba)

Travelling texts: A summary in Michael the Syrian's Chronography and its companions in Greek, Syriac and Arabic, with an incursion in Ethiopic

The 'Chronography' of Michael the Syrian († 1199) drew on earlier Syriac texts and is widely hailed as one of the great historiographical landmarks of the Middle Ages in the Near East, and more particularly as a watershed in Syriac literature. Whilst the sources Michael used were rich and varied, they were not always correctly attributed, as we shall attempt to show in the present paper in two cases. This paper seeks not only to demonstrate the misidentification of a source given by Michael the Syrian in the summary of his first chapter, but also to locate the specific texts to which that summary refers, and to examine certain of their features, referring wherever possible to their Vorlagen.

PAOLO LA SPISA (Università di Genova)

The Karshuni manuscript Vaticanus syriacus 202: palaeographic and philological remarks

The main aim of this paper is to present the codicological, paleographical and linguistic features of the *Vaticanus Syriacus 202 karshuni* manuscript (Va). Thanks to the colophons it is possible to argue that this codex was copied in Alep during the second half of the 17th century. Va contains a remarkable collection of works belonging to the

hagiographical as well as apocryphal and spiritual genres of the Christian Arabic literature. Here one can find for instance what is considered so far the most recent Arabic version of the martyrs of Najran, a version of the Apocalypse of Paul and, last but not least, some spiritual speeches of Mar Isaac the Syrian and Mar Efrem. The style and the language of the texts led one to suppose that the copy has been the work of only one person, in fact the same orthographic and stylistic features are well attested along the whole manuscript.

The study of this manuscript contributes to the knowledge of the Arabic language written in Syriac scripts. As a matter of fact the *karshuni* manuscripts science is not yet enough studied so far. For this reason it is important to highlight all the aspects of those varieties which belong to the so called Middle Arabic.